Sustainable Commons
Production and the
Virtues of Moderation

James Grimmelmann
New York Law School

TPRC
29 September 2007
(I) Motivation
Must you be a fool to contribute to a commons?
Not necessarily; people have intrinsic motivations.
But why are some communities sustainable . . .
... while others fail?
Does Wikipedia need to be more ...
. . . authoritarian?
(2) Semicommmons
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Rival</th>
<th>Non-Rival</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excludable</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Excludable</td>
<td>Common-Pool</td>
<td>Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excludable</td>
<td>Rival</td>
<td>Non-Rival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property</td>
<td></td>
<td>IP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Excludable</td>
<td>Tragedy</td>
<td>Undersupply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excludable</td>
<td>Rival</td>
<td>Non-Rival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commons</td>
<td></td>
<td>IP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tragedy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Undersupply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rival</td>
<td>Non-Rival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excludable</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>IP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Excludable</td>
<td>Tragedy</td>
<td>Undersupply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rival</td>
<td>Non-Rival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excludable</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>IP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Excludable</td>
<td>Tragedy</td>
<td>Commons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Offline semicommons
Online semicommmons
Layering
(3) Moderation patterns
Centralized or distributed?

Secret or transparent?

Prevent or respond?

Human or computer?
(4) Application
Whatever happened to USENET?
USENET was functional at the scale of a newsgroup . . .
...but it got the property boundaries wrong.
Smaller building blocks proved more stable.
Conclusion
The following images are © their respective photographers and are available under the indicated Creative Commons license:

- **Paving stones**: 1Sock, “Break It Down For Me,” [http://www.flickr.com/photos/1sock/301276274/](http://www.flickr.com/photos/1sock/301276274/), BY-NC-ND 2.0

The following images are used under 17 U.S.C. § 107 (“fair use”):

- Lolcat
- Wikipedia logo
- Death star
- Google logo
- USENET diagram
- Internet connectivity diagram

All other elements are © James Grimmelmann and are available under the Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 United States license.